

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
Site Area (acres)	27	49	76	50	25	11	32	118
Pipeline Area <sup>1</sup> (acres)	7.9	7.9	7.9	11.2	12.8	15.8	18.8	18.8
Total Area <sup>2</sup> (acres)	34.9	56.9	83.9	61.2	37.8	26.8	50.8	135.8
Distance from Matilija Dam (approximate miles) <sup>3</sup>	3.0	3.0	3.0	4.6	5.3	6.5	7.5	4.6 - 7.5
Storage Volume (cubic yards) <sup>4</sup>	671,000	1,667,000	2,339,000	800,000	500,000	240,000	700,000	2,240,000
Average Height of Fill (feet) <sup>5</sup>	15	35	15 – 35	6	15	13	14	6 – 15
Proximity to Active Channel	300+ feet to the east	700 feet to the east	-	Within the active channel	Within the active channel	0 feet to the west	50 – 600 feet to the west	-
Is there an existing buffer to the active river channel?	YES. Good quality native upland habitat present.	YES. Good quality native upland habitat present.	-	NO.	NO.	NO.	YES. Good quality native upland habitat present.	-
Slurry Disposal Site Containment <sup>6</sup>	Use of on-site native material to construct containment dikes to stabilize slurried sediments	Same as West MODA around exposed perimeter except along east bank adjacent to bluff.	-	Use of containment dikes, similar to West MODA, except this site will also require riprap stone of approx 2-ft diameter outside dike slopes to provide 5-10 yr level of erosion protection during frequent flood events	Similar to West MODA. Some on-site boulders may be used for dike construction.	Similar to Sub-Site 2	Similar to Sub-Site 2	-
Site Visibility	Visible from private property to the north and recreationists in the area.	Highly visible from the community of Meiners Oaks, to the north and east.	-	Visible in the distance from homes on either bank of the river channel and from Hwy 150 to the south.	Visible from portions of private residences to the east and from Hwy 150 to the north.	Minimal visibility from homes to the east; high visibility from private equestrian property to the west.	Minimal public visibility, but high visibility from private home and equestrian property to the west.	-

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
<b>Ambient Noise Source(s)</b>	<i>West MODA is buffered from traffic noise along Rice Road by the East MODA site. Sensitive noise receptors include recreationists who visit the Ventura River Preserve lands to the west and south for hiking, equestrian use, and general outdoor enjoyment.</i>	<i>East MODA is adjacent to the west of Rice Road, which produces ambient noise from consistent traffic in the form of passenger cars and large trucks with livestock trailers. Sensitive noise receptors include residents to the north, east, and south.</i>		<i>Existing ambient noise sources include traffic on roadways east and south of the site, and operational noise from the Ojai Organic Recycling facility to the southeast (mostly noticeable from the southern portions of Sub-Site 1). Sensitive noise receptors include residents located near the northern-most portion of Sub-Site 1.</i>	<i>Existing ambient noise is produced by traffic along Highway 150 / Baldwin Road and is particularly noticeable in the northern portion of Sub-Site 2. The southern portion of Sub-Site 2, farther away from the roadway, experiences lower ambient noise from the traffic. Private residences to the east are considered sensitive noise receptors.</i>	<i>Existing ambient noise at Sub-Site 3 is low, and is primarily characterized by traffic on Burnham Road to the west. Sensitive noise receptors at Sub-Site 3 include a private equestrian property and horse-boarding facility (P bar H Ranch), as well as a raptor rescue center located adjacent to the west.</i>	<i>Existing ambient noise is characterized by traffic along Santa Ana Road to the west. Sub-Site 4 is currently used as a horse pasture and is located on a private equestrian property, which is considered to be a sensitive noise receptor.</i>	
<b>Existing Land Use(s)</b>	<i>Natural floodway / floodplain; no existing development.</i>	<i>Site includes recreational trails maintained on private property by the Ojai Valley Lands Conservancy (OVLC), which has an easement for the trails on private property.</i>	-	<i>Natural floodway / floodplain; no existing development.</i>	<i>Natural floodway / floodplain; no existing development.</i>	<i>Natural floodway / floodplain; no existing development.</i>	<i>Site is located on a private ranch / equestrian property and is currently used as an irrigated grazing / pasture area by the property owner.</i>	-
<b>Existing Recreational Use(s)</b>	<i>Site is commonly used by local residents for river access and passive recreation (outdoor enjoyment, nature viewing, etc.).</i>	<i>Popular multi-use recreational trails are aligned on private property through the site and maintained under an easement by the OVLC. This area is regularly used by the public for passive recreation.</i>	-	<i>n/a</i>	<i>n/a</i>	<i>Dispersed equestrian use may occur.</i>	<i>Site is active pasture, but some recreational equestrian uses may occur.</i>	-

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
Adjacent Land Use(s)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Open space, active channel, and Ventura River Preserve lands managed by the OVLC to the west and south</li> <li>• Private homes and equestrian properties to the north</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Oso Equestrian Ranch to the North, access via Meyers Rd</li> <li>• Private homes and equestrian properties to the north and east</li> <li>• ~500 ft South of W El Roblar Dr on west side of S Rice Rd is a parking area used for access to OVLC trails</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A trailer park is within 900 feet to the east, buffered from Site by vegetation, access road, and channel</li> <li>• 14 homes to the east w/in 0.2 mile, along the west side of Moreno Dr</li> <li>• Several large homes and tennis courts ~0.15 mile to the west</li> <li>• Ojai Organic Recycling facility to the southeast</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A small residential community to the east; several modular homes and one larger home with equestrian facilities (a large arena / corral) are adjacent to the site</li> <li>• Active river channel adjacent to the west</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Private horse-boarding facility (P&amp;H Ranch) is adjacent to the west of the central and southern portions of the Site</li> <li>• A raptor rescue center is adjacent to the northwest</li> <li>• Communities in Oak View along Puesta del Sol are 0.1 mile east of the southern portion of the Site</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Site is surrounded by private horse ranching property to the north, west, and south; surrounding area is actively used as pasture</li> <li>• Active Ventura River channel to the east</li> </ul>	-
Site Access	Access through East MODA and the Meiners Oaks community to the north.	Access via Rice Rd to the east and Meyers Rd to the north (may require coordination with private property owners to the north).		Access is available from the south via Hwy 150, Old Baldwin Road, and a private access road through the Ojai Organic Recycling Facility. Access available to the east via an access road maintained by Ojai Valley Sanitary District.	Access is available via Hwy 150 / Baldwin Rd to the north.	Access via Burnham Rd to the west would require coordination with private property (P bar H Ranch) adjacent to the west.	Access via Santa Ana Rd to the west would require coordination with private ranch owners (site is located on the ranch).	-
Tree Removal (quantity / type)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 28 Oak</li> <li>• 0 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 104 Oak</li> <li>• 31 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 132 Oak</li> <li>• 31 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 44 Oak</li> <li>• 0 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 57 Oak</li> <li>• 0 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8 Oak</li> <li>• 5 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 19 Oak</li> <li>• 0 Walnut</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 128 Oak</li> <li>• 5 Walnut</li> </ul>

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
<b>Habitat Type(s) and Quantity</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 19 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 4.8 acres non-native annual grassland</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 4.9 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 27.6 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 7.0 acres coastal sage scrub</li> <li>• 7.8 acres oak woodland</li> <li>• 0.3 acre ruderal</li> <li>• 3.3 acres active channel / mulefat scrub</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 23.9 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 32.4 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 3.3 acres active channel / mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 7.0 acres coastal sage scrub</li> <li>• 7.8 acres oak woodland</li> <li>• 0.3 acre ruderal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 15.5 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 5.2 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 16.3 acres active channel (unvegetated)</li> <li>• 5.1 acres mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 5.7 acres coastal sage scrub</li> <li>• 0.1 acre oak woodland</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 5.0 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 9.0 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 1.3 acre active channel (unvegetated)</li> <li>• 5.6 acres mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 1.9 acres oak woodland</li> <li>• 0.05 acre ruderal</li> <li>• 0.1 acre barren</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 8.6 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 0.7 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 0.5 acres mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 0.2 acres ruderal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 0.4 acres mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 0.8 acres oak woodland</li> <li>• 22.0 acres ruderal</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 29.1 acres Venturan alluvial fan scrub</li> <li>• 14.9 acres non-native annual grassland</li> <li>• 17.6 active channel (unvegetated)</li> <li>• 11.6 acres mulefat scrub</li> <li>• 5.7 acres coastal sage scrub</li> <li>• 2.8 acres oak woodland</li> <li>• 22.3 acres ruderal</li> <li>• 0.5 acre barren</li> </ul>
<b>Potential Sensitive Species Habitat</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Silvery legless lizard</li> <li>• Coast horned lizard</li> <li>• Coast patch-nosed snake</li> <li>• Two-striped garter snake</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• San Diego desert woodrat</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Silvery legless lizard</li> <li>• Coast horned lizard</li> <li>• Coast patch-nosed snake</li> <li>• Two-striped garter snake</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• San Diego desert woodrat</li> </ul>	-	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Southern steelhead – southern California ESU</li> <li>• Silvery legless lizard</li> <li>• Coast horned lizard</li> <li>• Coast patch-nosed snake</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• San Diego desert woodrat</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Southern steelhead – southern California ESU</li> <li>• Silvery legless lizard</li> <li>• Coast horned lizard</li> <li>• Coast patch-nosed snake</li> <li>• Two-striped garter snake</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• Least Bell's vireo</li> <li>• San Diego desert woodrat</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Silvery legless lizard</li> <li>• Coast horned lizard</li> <li>• Coast patch-nosed snake</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• Least Bell's vireo</li> <li>• San Diego desert woodrat</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• California red-legged frog</li> <li>• Southwestern pond turtle</li> <li>• Two-striped garter snake</li> <li>• Yellow warbler</li> <li>• White-tailed kite</li> <li>• Yellow-breasted chat</li> <li>• Loggerhead shrike</li> <li>• Least Bell's vireo</li> <li>• Pallid bat</li> </ul>	-
<b>Description of Existing Vegetation</b>	The northern portions of this site are fenced pasture for livestock (horses) and severely grazed. Most of the remainder of the site	Abandoned orchard covers a large part of this site and supports ruderal and non-native grassland. Signs of native recruitment	-	The western half of the site includes the main channel as well as a series of small braided channels. The eastern half of the	The site comprises high- and low-elevation terraces extending from the bluffs that demarcate the edge of the floodplain	Most of the site is located on an old, elevated stream terrace. The older terrace supports well-developed, species-rich	Area currently used as horse pasture. Dominant vegetation on-site is ruderal however, there are several significant stands of coast live	-

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
	<p><i>is composed of old stream terraces primarily vegetated by mule-fat scrub. These terraces support well-developed Venturan alluvial scrub, coastal sage scrub, and oak woodland, with small patches of non-native annual grassland. These terraces have a well-developed microbiotic soil crust.</i></p>	<p><i>by coastal sage scrub and alluvial floodplain scrub shrubs as well as coast live oak and western sycamore are present in this area. Dense coast live oak woodland, with chaparral understory, occurs along the top and sides of the bluff and grades into oak-sycamore woodland along the toe of the bluff. Extensive patches of mule-fat scrub occur in the lower elevation, southern and western portions of the site along drainage features and Cozy Dell Creek. Large patches of floodplain alluvial scrub/coastal sage scrub vegetation occur adjacent to riparian scrub, on slightly older terraces along the southern and western edges of this site. Older terraces have well-developed microbiotic soil crusts.</i></p>		<p><i>site includes old stream terraces that support well-developed floodplain alluvial scrub with oaks and sycamore. Non-native annual grassland, with small patches of native, perennial bunchgrass is also present. A well-developed microbiotic soil crust is present on the older terraces. The lower elevation terraces within the support mule-fat scrub and early-stage floodplain alluvial scrub (mainly scale-broom). The active channel of the Ventura River is mostly devoid of vegetation.</i></p>	<p><i>westward to the western edge of the active channel of the Ventura River. The northern half of the site is old terrace dominated by non-native grassland (with patches of native, perennial bunchgrass). Coast live oak trees are scattered across this grassland area and grade into more contiguous oak-sycamore woodland along the base and sides of the bluff. Extensive patches of mule-fat scrub extend along the western side of the grassland and are associated with a series of braided channels that ties into the active river channel. The base of the bluff appears to have seeps or otherwise collects and conveys surface flows southward along the eastern edge of the site. This area supports mulefat scrub and wetland habitat including facultative wetland species (such as Carex and Typha), and grades into mule-fat scrub found throughout the southern portions of the site. There are a</i></p>	<p><i>floodplain alluvial scrub with oaks and sycamore. Ruderal vegetation, including non-native annual grassland, is present. A well-developed microbiotic soil crust is present on the older portions of the terrace. The lower elevation terraces within the boundary of the site (closer to the main channels of the Ventura River) support riparian scrub and early-stage floodplain alluvial scrub (mainly scale-broom).</i></p>	<p><i>oak and western sycamore trees scattered across the northern and south-central portions of the site. Portions of the site are irrigated for horse pasturage. The northern quarter of the site is fenced and is practically devoid of shrub and ground vegetation. Scattered coast live oak and western sycamore are present in this area.</i></p>	

**Table 1. Comparison of Slurry Disposal Sites**

Site	MODA			BRDA				
	West MODA	East MODA	Combined MODA	Sub-Site 1	Sub-Site 2	Sub-Site 3	Sub-Site 4	Combined BRDA
					<i>number of small, old stream terraces in the western and southwestern portions of the site, adjacent to the main active channel, that support well-developed floodplain alluvial scrub/coastal sage scrub vegetation. These older terraces have well-developed microbial soil crusts.</i>			

<sup>1</sup> The “pipeline area” is an estimate of temporary land disturbance associated with the slurry pipeline and access road (pipeline disturbance area would be a temporary construction impact). This estimate is based upon the assumption that a 20-foot wide swath of land would be required to accommodate the pipeline and road for the distance between the Matilija Dam and the southern-most border of each proposed slurry site location. Actual length of the slurry pipeline and access road may not be the same as the distance from the dam, depending upon final engineering design which will take into account factors such as slope and existing terrain. The total pipeline area for the BRDA Sub-Sites was estimated based upon the distance between Matilija Dam and the downstream border of Sub-Site 4 because it is assumed that one continuous slurry pipeline and access road area would be used for all four BRDA sub-sites.

<sup>2</sup> The “total area” is an estimate of land disturbance associated with use of each proposed slurry disposal area. This estimate is a sum of the proposed site area and the pipeline area. As described for the pipeline area estimate, it is assumed that one continuous slurry pipeline and access road area would be used for either the Combined MODA or the Combined BRDA sites; therefore, the total area accounts for one 20-wide path from Matilija Dam to the downstream border of the disposal area which is farthest away (downstream) from the dam.

<sup>3</sup> Distance reflects the approximate miles from Matilija Dam to the upstream-border of each site (in comparison with pipeline area, which is calculated using distance to downstream-site border).

<sup>4</sup> Storage volume estimate for BRDA Sub-Site 2: Chitwood, 2008; Storage volume estimates for MODA and BRDA Sub-Sites 1, 3, and 4: VCWPD, 2003

<sup>5</sup> VCWPD, 2003 [VCWPD (Ventura County Watershed Protection District), 2003. Matilija Dam Ecosystem Restoration Project Feasibility Study: Report on Slurry Fine Disposal / Habitat Restoration Sites. December. [Available online: <http://www.matilijadam.org/reports.htm>]]

<sup>6</sup> VCWPD, 2003